Book Reviews

Makhno and Memory: Anarchist and Mennonite Narratives of Ukraine's Civil War, 1917-1921. By Sean Patterson. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press. 2020. Pp. 216, xi. Illustrations, notes, bibliography, and index. Paper. $27.95.

Makhno and Memory is a valuable addition to the scholarly literature on both Nestor Makhno and the Ukrainian Mennonite community. Sean Patterson accomplishes his central goal—explaining how Mennonites and Makhnovites came to understand one another and justified their tragic and often violent interactions. Reviewers sometimes fall prey to the temptation to criticize authors for the book they did not write, and this review essay may appear to do just that, but I will argue that some of the elements of the Makhno story that Patterson does not address are too important to his thesis to be left out. Still, one of the real merits of his book is that it begs a larger dialogue about both Makhno and the Mennonites, and my intent, in enumerating some of the gaps in the argument, is to engage in such a dialogue, with the hope that it will lead to a fuller understanding of this important subject.

Patterson sets out to explain why Mennonites and anarchists have such diametrically opposed understandings of Makhno's rebellion. The Mennonite perspective is well known, but Patterson ably retells their version of the story, stressing the role of the Mennonite self-defense units (*Selbstschutz*) that both provoked controversy within the Mennonite community and contributed to the ferocity of the Makhnovite campaign of terror against the Mennonites.

Where Patterson particularly shines is in his recounting of the anarchist construction of the story. He carefully pieces together the various anarchist accounts of the actions of Makhno, other leaders of his movement, and his rank-and-file supporters, addressing the questionable reliability of the evidence and reconstructing a plausible narrative from the various threads. He correctly emphasizes the chaotic wartime conditions that engulfed southern Ukraine from 1918 to 1921, and places the height of the Makhnovite terror—six weeks in the autumn and winter of 1919—in the context of the Bolshevik attack on, and Makhnovite retreat from, Ekaterinoslav.

While this reconstruction and contextualization is skillfully done, Patterson's attempt to explain the violence within a general framework of "revolutionary terror" is less convincing. His definition stresses the way that revolutionary conditions led to "conflicting notions of justice [coming] into conflict, triggering, as in the case of Makhno and the Mennonites, a state of escalating violence in which each group attempts to use force and fear to compel the enemy to accept their regime" (142). As an explanation of Mennonite and Makhnovite *perceptions* of events, this has merit—it is clearly true of the Makhnovites, who saw the

Mennonites as collaborators with the White Armies, and it is consistent with an important Mennonite explanation that saw the Makhnovite depredations as God's punishment of Mennonites for breaking with pacifism. However, Patterson is not just documenting the perceptions of the participants—he is speaking here in his own authorial voice, and his "bothsideism" blames Mennonites for their own persecution. At their height, the Mennonite self-defense units had perhaps 3,000 members, drawn from both Mennonite and non-Mennonite communities. With a handful of notable exceptions, their actions were limited to defending their own communities. By comparison, at his height, Makhno commanded roughly 100,000 armed people and claimed authority over more than 100,000 square miles of southern Ukraine. The Makhnovites sent troops into the Mennonite villages where they committed murders and rapes and violently confiscated food, livestock, firearms, and clothing. It is incongruous to suggest that even the worst actions of the self-defense units can be seen as the Mennonites trying to "use force and fear to compel the enemy to accept their regime."

One of the major failings of Makhno scholarship—a failing which Patterson is also sometimes guilty of—is a willingness to accept Makhno's own account of his actions and beliefs at face value. This is important to Patterson's attempt to define Makhnovite attacks on Mennonites as rooted in class rather than ethnicity. To his credit, Patterson addresses the unreliability of memoirs and acknowledges the mythology of anarchist scholarship that ignores or rejects evidence of Makhnovite terror, but he also accepts Makhno's account of his anarchist beliefs.

Makhno appears in *Makhno and Memory* as a sophisticated anarchist intellectual, deeply versed in the writings of Peter Kropotkin and motivated to achieve the ideals of philosophical anarchism. This characterization strains credulity. Makhno was a poor Ukrainian peasant who worked as an agricultural laborer from the time he was 8 or 9 years old. The schools he attended—when he attended them at all—offered only rudimentary literacy, and few peasants completed the limited curriculum they offered.[1] Whatever additional education Makhno might have acquired from the other members of the anarchist Union of Poor Peasants, which he joined at the age of 17, would have been squeezed in between working at hard physical labor and the "robbery, arson, and murder" the group pursued as its main pastime (5). In his memoirs, Makhno claimed that he read Kropotkin's *Mutual Aid* in the notorious Butyrka political prison and "kept it with me constantly in order to discuss it with comrades." But he also claimed that he spent much of his prison time in solitary confinement (5). The idea that Makhno had the time or ability to read and understand Kropotkin while in Butyrka also strains credulity.

These claims about Makhno's philosophical beliefs come from his own memoirs and the influential accounts of Volin (Vsevolod Eikhenbaum) and Peter Arshinov, all written in Paris in the 1920s. Makhno provides the principal evidence of his own philosophical sophistication in his 1926 memoir, and so the context in which that memoir was written becomes extremely important. By then he was

1. Boris N. Mironov, "Development of Literacy in Russia and the USSR," *History of Education Quarterly* 31:2 (Summer 1991), 239.

living in an émigré community where status and influence were in short supply and people were constructing a past to serve their claims to status in their new present. As the burgeoning field of memory scholarship tells us, under such circumstances the past was often written, "not as it was but as it might have been."[2] In such a context anarchist writers had strong reasons to rewrite their history as ideologically pure, to attempt to refute charges of ethnic violence, and to claim that "excesses" were carried out by disobedient followers—all common elements of the Makhno mythology that Patterson repeats. Key elements of Makhno's biography, including his purported meetings with Lenin and Kropotkin, are based solely on Makhno's uncorroborated claims in 1926.

Makhno surely considered himself to be an anarchist in 1917-1920, but he said little during his rebellion about how he understood anarchism. At the time he was wholly occupied by commanding his forces; orders and directives issued in his name were mainly limited to administrative and judicial matters, and they reveal almost nothing about his underlying beliefs. The veneer of intellectual sophistication that was carefully applied in later years in Paris is absent from these orders and directives. When Makhno made references to class during the rebellion, they were always ambiguous and inchoate. In a typical example he exhorted "peasants and workers . . . to organize and fight for your rights," but in the same moment he invoked the "blood, shed by the peasantry"—the peasantry alone—as the key symbol of sacrifice.[3]

The reason that understanding Makhno's ideological beliefs is important is that Patterson offers those beliefs as representative of the beliefs of the larger Makhno movement. This is the basis for the claim that Makhnovite depredations were rooted in class antagonism. While Patterson acknowledges that there is some evidence that ethnic hatred played a role in the violence, he insists that class played the leading role.

The class argument implies that the Makhnovites were a class-conscious proletariat, a characterization that fits Makhno's 1926 account but is out of step with most understandings of the Ukrainian (and Russian) peasantry during the civil war. Regardless of how Makhno himself defined class, there is little evidence that his supporters applied such divisions within the Mennonite villages, except in the singular case of Eichenfeld when the Makhnovites picked out and murdered landowners while sparing laborers. This case is not a sufficient explanation of Makhnovite beliefs, and the extent to which Mennonites—many of whom were landless laborers and renters by 1919—were a collective target of the Makhnovites begs for a better explanation.

Insofar as the peasants followed Makhno's orders and fought against external forces, their actions reflected Makhno's words: They wanted to exclude external

2. For a useful summary of memory scholarship and the Russian émigré community in Paris, see Natalia Starostina, "On Nostalgia and Courage: Russian Émigré Experience in Interwar Paris through the Eyes of Nadezhda Teffi," *Diasporas: Circulations, Migrations, Histoire* 22 (2013), 38-53.

3. Nestor Makhno, "Iz prikaza komanduiushchego partizansko-povstancheskoi armei Bat'ki Makhno ob obiazannostiakh povstantsev I zadachakh partizansko-povstancheskogo dvizheniia," Nov. 18, 1919.

forces and govern themselves. But this hardly makes them anarchists. Indeed, as Mark Baker shows in his valuable study of peasants in Kharkhiv *guberniia*, their actions are consistent with a long tradition of peasant "localness" in the Russian Empire dating back centuries.[4] If this was in some sense "anarchism," it was a naive peasant anarchism far distant from the visions of anarchist elites. Indeed, the actions of Makhnovist peasants might more usefully be characterized as "anti-colonialism." They saw Mennonites as outsiders, inextricably associated with state interests, and therefore a legitimate target for their anti-colonial wrath.

Patterson hints at the alternative of explaining Makhnovite depredations as anti-colonialism when he correctly describes Mennonites as representatives of the tsarist colonial system, at least in the minds of the peasants. New Russia was an explicitly colonial space, and the state treated the region's Slavic population as colonial subjects, recruiting "foreign colonists"—most significantly Mennonites—as colonial agents intended to provide a "modern" model for the "backward" Slavs. In this strange inversion of colonialism, German-speaking Mennonites from Poland represented the Russian colonial state, while Russian and Ukrainian peasants became the subjects of colonial power.

This points to an explanation for Makhnovite attacks on Mennonites that has little to do with anarchism or class conflict: Arguably, the peasants who made up most of the Makhnovite armies were motivated as much by anti-colonialism as by class antagonism. Unfortunately, Patterson does not follow this line of thought through to its logical conclusion. The bulk of Makhno's supporters were peasants, and they behaved, not like ideological anarchists, but much like peasant rebels everywhere. Arguably, they attacked people they saw as agents of colonial oppression, not class enemies.

These criticisms do not negate the real value of *Makhno and Memory*. Whether or not Makhno was a sophisticated philosophical anarchist, whether or not his peasant supporters were anarchists at all, and whether or not they attacked Mennonites out of class hostility, anti-colonial anger, or simple ethnic hatred, the heart of Patterson's argument holds. Much of what has been written about Makhno, by both Mennonites and anarchists, suffers from its reliance on ahistorical mythmaking. Patterson effectively identifies the sources and preconceptions of these sources and moves our understanding into new territory. There is much more work to be done. The Soviet mythology of Makhno as a bandit and the post-Soviet Ukrainian mythology of Makhno as a Ukrainian hero equally distort our understanding, and any full accounting of Makhno will have to deal with these myths too. Patterson has begun the important work of clearing away the many obstacles to a better understanding of the Makhno rebellion.

Fredonia University JOHN STAPLES

---

4. Baker both documents peasant localism in Kharkhiv guberniia and thoroughly reviews the broader historiography. See Mark Baker, *Peasants, Power, and Place: Revolution in the Villages of Kharkhiv Province, 1914-1921* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2016).

The Lives of Amish Women. By Karen M. Johnson-Weiner. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press. 2020. $49.95.

Based on thirty-five years of research as a participant-observer in Amish communities across five states, anthropologist Karen Johnson-Weiner presents a thorough assessment of Amish women's lives in contemporary America. Her study makes an important contribution to a growing literature that portrays the Amish woman as someone who is much more complex than the stereotypical farm wife in a bonnet. The author focuses on the diversity of Amish women's experience in the twenty-first century, as some continue to live a traditional agrarian life while others live in communities that support themselves primarily through entrepreneurial activities or wage labor.

Johnson-Weiner begins her study with a brief history of Amish women's origins among the persecuted and martyred Anabaptists of Reformation Europe before moving to the American portion of their story, including immigration to colonial Pennsylvania, movement into the Midwest in the nineteenth century, and subsequent divisions into multiple affiliations in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. She then closely examines specific categories of female experience in contemporary Amish life: socialization in girlhood; marriage; Amish women's group activities; the experiences of women who are not wives and mothers; women's contributions to the family economy; and Amish women's reading habits. As she considers each of these topics, Johnson-Weiner notes significant variations in women's experience depending on whether they are members of an agrarian, entrepreneurial, or wage-earning Amish community.

In her chapter on women who do not conform to the prescribed role of wife and mother, Johnson-Weiner draws attention to a population that Amish studies scholars too often neglect. In a society organized around patriarchal families with numerous children, the widow, childless wife, and never-married woman are the focus of a chapter titled "Women Out of the Ordinary" (133). Nevertheless, she finds that these women make a place for themselves in their communities and enact the supportive, nurturing, and mentoring characteristics of ideal Amish womanhood in roles other than those of wife or mother. A never-married woman might become a schoolteacher or devote herself to the care of aged parents. Depending on the community, a childless wife and her husband might help raise nieces and nephews, take in foster children, or build a business together. Johnson-Weiner recounts the experiences of an unmarried Amish woman who started a house-cleaning business and now mentors the younger Amish women in her employ. In all instances, these women report a sense of purpose in their lives and accept their lack of a husband or children, or both, as part of God's plan.

Johnson-Weiner's investigation of Amish women's reading material perhaps best demonstrates the diversity of their lives in the twenty-first century. Analyzing the content of three distinctive women's periodicals and reader response to that content, Johnson-Weiner deftly differentiates the experiences and self-image of Amish women in agrarian, entrepreneurial, and wage-earning communities. Readers of *Little Red Hen News*, such as members of the Swartzentruber Amish in upstate New York, continue to live the life of their ancestors. They forgo all modern conveniences, reside on family farms, and view farming as a sacred way

of life that involves all members of the family. In this decidedly low-tech publication, typed and photocopied on plain paper stock, readers share recipes and how-to advice and read stories that illustrate the value of hard work and obedience. The world portrayed in *Little Red Hen News* is one where women and men work cooperatively in the farm family economy and enact their faith on a daily basis as they maintain responsible stewardship of God's land in order to bequeath it to the next generation of Amish farmers. Biblical injunctions about women's proper place are unnecessary.

In contrast, the glossy magazines *Ladies' Journal* and *Keepers at Home* present an Amish world where men work away from home and women identify themselves chiefly as homemakers and housewives. Johnson-Weiner notes that a Pennsylvania Amish woman introduced her to *Ladies' Journal*, and the periodical best responds to and reflects the experiences of women in entrepreneurial communities, such as the Old Order Amish of Lancaster County, Pennsylvania. Here, where the scarcity and expense of farmland have increasingly caused Amish families to move off the farm and into family-owned businesses, Amish women and their families necessarily engage with members of the outside world as their customers or business associates. In the pages of *Ladies' Journal*, readers and contributors acknowledge the existence of the modern, secular world but reinforce the choice of Christian women to remain steadfast in their commitment to faith and family, whether they are at home or at work in the family business. Biblical references remind readers that they and their family members should submit to God's authority, but the magazine represents submission as a quality equally important for both women and men. In *Keepers at Home*, on the other hand, articles and readers' letters emphasize women's submission to both God and their husbands. Highly popular in Indiana's Elkhart-LaGrange settlement, where Amish husbands earn factory wages while their wives tend the home, *Keepers at Home* emphasizes a narrower role for women and employs biblical language to underscore their identity as housewives. As Johnson-Weiner acknowledges, however, the women who write to and for the publication are active participants in the creation of this new way of being Amish women.

In her concluding chapter, Johnson-Weiner builds on her analysis of periodical literature to argue persuasively that as an Amish group moves further away from cultural traditions and practices, it relies more heavily on scriptural texts and interpretations to maintain its identity. For those women at furthest remove from their historical role on the farm, personal expressions of faith and frequent reference to biblical authority become commonplace as they define themselves as full-time Amish housewives. In doing so, however, the gulf between themselves and more traditional Amish women grows wider. Johnson-Weiner thus leaves her reader with the question of what makes a woman an Amish woman when both a Swartzentruber farm wife and an Elkhart-LaGrange housewife can claim the same identity. As she notes, a common history, a common language (Pennsylvania Dutch), and an Amish self-identity are among the elements that bind diverse communities of Amish women together. Johnson-Weiner brings her study to a close by quoting an Amish woman who explains, "What makes someone Amish is they're born that way" (246).

Johnson-Weiner has produced a lively, accessible book that is filled with Amish women's own voices. In her admirable attempt to reach a lay audience, however, the author sometimes employs language that scholars will find lacking in nuance or precision. For example, she frequently uses the broad designations of "conservative" and "progressive" when differentiating one branch of the Amish from another. Even then, the newcomer to Amish studies may still have difficulty understanding which group is which. Inclusion of a chart listing characteristics of the various Amish groups and a map showing their major locations of settlement would have aided such readers. Johnson-Weiner's study nevertheless remains a career-capping achievement and is a significant addition to the literature of Amish studies, Anabaptist studies, and gender studies.

Ohio University KATHERINE JELLISON

The Profit of the Earth: The Global Seeds of American Agriculture. By Courtney Fullilove. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press. 2017. $40.

In an era of widespread concern about global diversity losses, both biological and human, Courtney Fullilove's wide-ranging book *The Profit of the Earth* digs into some neglected corners of agricultural history to remind us that these concerns are not only modern ones. By presenting her careful research into topics like the role played by the U.S. Patent Office in global agriculture, battles between "patent" and "ethical" medicines in the late 1800s, and modern efforts to conserve the genetics of global grain crops, Fullilove illustrates how our understanding of agriculture has long been vulnerable to simplifying impulses that neglect the history of human effort and biological diversity that together produce the seeds we hold in our hands. Of special interest to Anabaptist readers, she devotes two full chapters to an analysis of the Russian Mennonite legacy on agriculture in the Great Plains. Overall, I found this book to be full of fascinating historical analysis and a quirky cast of characters, together with insights that caused me to evaluate my own understandings of conservation and agriculture in helpful ways. This work is an important and thought-provoking addition to crucial current discussions on the best ways to promote agricultural conservation and resilience.

Fullilove accomplishes a lot in this slim volume (220 pages, excluding endnotes). The book is organized around three main themes, separated by brief stories and reflections from Fullilove's recent research trips with agronomic geneticists to the Caucasus and Middle East. Her first theme, "collection," explores how thoroughly agricultural decisions and practices are connected to political motivations. The main story here revolves around the U.S. Patent Office, which worked with multiple military and economic missions in the first half of the nineteenth century to collect and then disseminate seeds and other agricultural materials to American farmers. Recognizing both implicitly, and sometimes explicitly, that propagation of European-style farming across the new country was necessary for the government's expansionist aims, the Patent Office gathered promising materials from across the globe. In their cataloging, though, the Patent

Office ignored the agricultural history of the peasant groups they had selected for collecting the seeds, working instead from a model of single-source innovation for monoculture (e.g., attempts to grow tea commercially in the U.S.) that was more easily commodified.

The second theme, "migration," focuses on the immigration of Anabaptist groups to the Plains region in the later 1800s. Fullilove's argument here has two main emphases. First, that the wheat seeds and cultivation practices brought by the Mennonites from Russia set the standard for productive monoculture grain cropping that has continued to dominate these grasslands ever since. And second, that the success of this model was due both to hard work of these immigrant farming communities and to subsidies of opportunity that mirrored those their ancestors had received a century before in imperial Russia. In the first instance, she shows that the strong climatic match between eastern Ukraine and Kansas and rich prairie soils helped the grains the Mennonites brought to flourish. Crucially, though, these grains represented thousands of years of human selection for desirable traits, much of which had been done by semi-nomadic peoples on the Ukrainian steppes across the centuries. This history was quickly flattened as American agriculture mechanized and expanded, since this wheat diversity was nearly subsumed under the "Turkey Red" variety from the 1870s onward.

The second emphasis is one that has received increasing attention in Mennonite circles in recent years: that the availability of farmlands for immigrant settlers was directly preceded by forced removal of indigenous American populations. Together with the capital that many families brought and the incentives provided by both the government and railroad companies (that owned the sub-dividable plots along their lines), these Anabaptists often succeeded financially where many other early prairie homesteaders struggled. This is not to diminish the important role of faith community-based economics that also marked these groups, which Fullilove nicely illustrates. She thus gives her readers important food for thought without leading us to specific conclusions or responses.

The final section, "preservation," seems at first the most loosely connected to her core theses. These chapters center on the changing American medical industry at the turn of the last century. In that period, so-called "ethical" medicines that were produced in laboratories to standards of scientific purity gradually came to dominate (as they still do), at the expense of numerous ethnobotanically-based streams of medicine practiced by many peoples. Here Fullilove smartly connects arguments about overall biodiversity conservation with separate ones about preferred agricultural practices. A central character of these chapters is John Uri Lloyd, a chemist and entrepreneur whose botanically-derived medicines slowly declined in use around 1900, partly due to his own consistent empirical laboratory rigor, and partly to the diminishing stocks of wild plants upon which his medicines depended (as agricultural acreage expanded). Fullilove devotes an entire chapter to discussing Lloyd's cult science-fiction classic, *Etidorhpa*, where he most enduringly grappled with the limits of human knowledge in a complex and surprising world. Coming during an age of great confidence in scientific progress, his was a counter-cultural note that should continue to be sounded in our own time of techno-corporate consolidation.

As I hope this brief summary shows, *Profit of the Earth* is a fascinating read, shedding light on some of the people, entities, and themes in the United States during its formative century, about which I, for one, was largely unaware. The range of sources she uses, and the careful weaving together of their content, which continues through the endnotes, are truly impressive. For a relatively short book, it has a detailed, fourteen-page index, containing no less than eighteen referenced subheadings for "Mennonite," and fifty for "wheat"! In sum, this is a very creative piece of quality scholarship for which Fullilove should be commended.

Nevertheless, after a second reading, I do have two stylistic bones to pick with her. First, Fullilove's writing can often become overly complicated, which runs the risk of burying important ideas in the shuffle of confusing wording. For instance, "[t]he grammars we use to structure temporality express control, but the seed's immensity and defiance exposes their artifice, contrivance and limits" (212) seems a strange way to highlight the book's conclusion, especially when compared to a point she had earlier made more simply and eloquently: "seeds embody deep temporal knowledge. Yet their casing renders them opaque . . . concealing the labor and knowledge they contain" (11). My second, deeper wish was for her to include more "connective tissue" in the book. The book covers a disparate range of topics, and the relationships among them can be fairly opaque. Although a picture does emerge from the histories she describes, it feels somewhat scattershot. And even though I know scholars impart judgments sparingly, in this case some amount of implication-drawing would strengthen the book. The general picture that emerges is one of caution at reducing the world's diversity, and there are many reasons why that message is important today.

In sum, this book is a good choice for those wishing to understand changes in American agriculture in the 1800s, and particularly for the role of Mennonites in Great Plains agriculture. I further recommend this book to all those looking for new ways to understand the importance of scientific humility and a renewed emphasis on wide-ranging intellectual and practical alliances to inform our human actions in this age of complexity.

Merry Lea Environmental Learning Center of Goshen College JONATHON SCHRAMM

Landscape of Migration: Mobility and Environmental Change on Bolivia's Tropical Frontier, 1952 to the Present. By Ben Nobbs-Thiessen. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press. 2020. $37.50.

The 1952 Bolivian Revolution and its aftermath have attracted growing scholarly interest over the past two decades. Ben Nobbs-Thiessen focuses on parts of that history that have often been ignored: the large-scale migration to the country's eastern lowlands and its social, economic, and environmental consequences. The migrants included Aymara and Quechua people from the western highlands as well as international immigrants, particularly the Okinawans and Japanese who moved to the region in the 1950s, and the

Mennonites who came in large numbers from northern Mexico starting in the late 1960s. The book traces the migrants' varied paths to the Santa Cruz department and their actions once they arrived. It uses an impressive collection of sources, including official archives in multiple countries as well as personal diaries, documents, and oral histories from migrants.

The Movimiento Nacionalista Revolucionario (MNR) regime that took power in 1952 promoted migration from the highlands to the more sparsely populated tropical regions in the East. It had multiple motives. By sponsoring migration and rural settlement the MNR sought to promote domestic food production, strengthen Bolivia's claims to its eastern frontier, and defuse labor and peasant militancy in the highlands. Though the MNR was overthrown in a 1964 military coup, all successor regimes have agreed that the East should be a center of national economic development—an "enduring frontier consensus" (20).

Nobbs-Thiessen offers a perceptive analysis of the propaganda films of Bolivian director Jorge Ruiz, produced with MNR and US support. The films promoted migration and agricultural development in the East as the fulfillment of a masculine nationalist destiny. Audiovisual sources have received relatively little attention from historians of this period, but they have much to offer.

The most original part of the book, though, is the story of how migrants themselves engaged with the rhetoric and laws of the national government. Each migrant group developed a practice of "agrarian citizenship" to justify its claims to land, state subsidies, and legal rights. In petitions to government officials they appealed to the state's goals of economic diversification, food security, and claims to supposedly "abandoned" frontier lands. The Okinawans and Japanese touted their cultivation of rice for the domestic market. Mennonites and other Protestant settlers stressed their production of dairy and soy products, along with their contribution to disaster relief and other public services in a region with scant state presence.

Migrants from the highlands tended to emphasize both their contributions to the national well-being and their rights as Bolivians, which foreign immigrants usually could not. Indigenous Bolivians faced greater hostility from Santa Cruz society, however. The lighter-skinned residents of Santa Cruz, particularly the middle and upper classes, considered the indigenous migrants just as foreign as—yet racially inferior to—the international migrants. The hostile reaction to the "invasion" of highlanders sharpened the reactionary political identity of the Santa Cruz region, which spawned violent far-right protests against the progressive government of Evo Morales in the twenty-first century.

Of the international migrants, the Mennonites would ultimately have the largest long-term impact on Santa Cruz. Though they always declared themselves apolitical, and their missionary activity remained limited (due in part to internal disagreements over whether they should be engaged in evangelizing), Mennonite settlers shaped the economy and the landscape in a variety of ways. They imported cattle and farm machinery and produced a large share of certain goods. Nobbs-Thiessen demonstrates their central role in the spread of soy cultivation, which is today Bolivia's second-most valuable export and covers vast expanses of land in eastern Bolivia and neighboring countries. By the turn of this century

Bolivian Mennonites (who numbered some 70,000 as of 2010) accounted for about 40 percent of Bolivian soy production. While soy has been a boon to Bolivia's economy, the environmental consequences have been much less positive. The book does not go into depth about those impacts, but does note that soy cultivation has replaced lush forests with "a vast treeless plain" (227).

The links between migration and environmental change are also apparent in the "push" factors that forced people to relocate. Midcentury drought in northern Mexico was partly responsible for the Mennonite emigration, while droughts in 1956 and 1983 contributed to Andean migration to the lowlands. Environmental forces, mediated by human actions, precipitated key social and economic changes at other times as well—for instance, when the devastation of Peru's offshore anchovy population in the early 1970s (due to a combination of El Niño and overfishing) provided an incentive to develop Bolivian soy exports as a protein alternative to fishmeal.

Landscape of Migration succeeds on multiple levels: as a study of post-1952 Bolivian history, of the transnational lives of migrants to the lowlands, and of the relationship between migration and environmental history. It will hopefully serve as a model for the study of migration and agricultural frontiers elsewhere in the world.

University of Massachusetts Amherst KEVIN A. YOUNG

Brethren Intersections: History, Identity, Crosscurrents. Edited by Jared S. Burkholder. Spring Grove, Pa.: The Brethren Encyclopedia, Inc. 2020. $20.

This edited volume collects lectures and papers presented at the Sixth Brethren World Assembly, held in Winona Lake, Indiana, in August 2018. This quinquennial gathering provides a forum for discussion among the seven largest denominations that trace their theological identity back to the community of men and women founded in the eighteenth century under the leadership of Alexander Mack in Schwarzenau, Germany: the Church of the Brethren; the Brethren Church; the Fellowship of Grace Brethren Churches; the Conservative Grace Brethren Churches; the Dunkard Brethren Church; the Old German Baptist Brethren; and the Old German Baptist Brethren New Conference. The contributors to the volume come from all of these groups, and while many are scholars of history and theology, others serve as pastors, denominational executives, missionaries, and more. Like the 2018 assembly, the edited volume centers on the theme of "intersections," or connections and "crosscurrents . . . across geographic borders, cultural and social boundaries, and even intersections with those within the Brethren fold but who identify with a different branch of the tradition" (15). The papers and lectures all examine this theme in one way or another.

The volume is neatly divided into four sections. The first section examines Brethren intersections across time, focused mostly on issues of Brethren theological identities and how those identities were shaped by and through theological conflicts; political, social, and religious contexts; and encounters with

"the other." The second section, titled "Intersecting Responses to American Evangelicalism," considers the diversity of Brethren engagements with conservative Protestant individuals, groups, and movements during the "eras" of three major revivalists: Charles Finney, Billy Sunday, and Billy Graham. The third section focuses on Brethren attitudes toward foreign missions. The fourth and final section addresses Brethren responses to war and peace. As the editor notes in his preface, the essays vary not only in terms of the topics and themes but also "in terms of tone, length, audience, and the degree of source citation" (5).

As with any edited volume, some contributions stand out more than others. I found that Dale Stoffer's chapter on "metanarratives of 'the other'" in Brethren history provided a generative framework for how sectarian groups conceptualize and perform their relationships to other religious groups—a framework that could be extended profitably to other forms of difference. What, for instance, were the "metanarratives" that the predominantly white Brethren churches used to make sense of their relationship to the African-American community, or to African-Americans within their congregations? Moreover, given my own research and writing on the intersections between Anabaptism and evangelicalism in the history and theology of the Brethren in Christ Church, I appreciated the three chapters by Stephen Longenecker, Jason Barnhart, and Bill Kostlevy on Brethren responses to evangelicalism. I was particularly intrigued by Kostlevy's distinction between the "radical" and "dispossessed" groups, like the Brethren—who embraced a conversionist faith but not the social and religious prestige that came with institutional evangelicalism—and the "elites," like Billy Graham, who commanded a conversionist empire more visibly and authoritatively. I wondered, though, in each paper how questions not only of theological difference—e.g., Brethren differ from evangelicals because of their commitments to nonconformity, nonviolence, etc.—but also of economic, cultural, and racial difference might have structured these responses. For instance, what role did middle-class economic mobility, suburbanization, and professionalization play in attracting some Brethren to the young, handsome, TV-friendly, and polished Graham and the brand of Protestantism that he represented?

One of the volume's most unique contributions is an examination of Brethren memory of the Civil War by Aaron Jerviss. Rooting his analysis in the various memorial cultures that emerged in the United States between 1865 and 1960—including the Southern "Lost Cause" as well as the "emancipationist" vision that celebrated African-American contributions to the war effort and their pursuit of freedom and emancipation—Jerviss argues that Brethren consumed and embraced these dominant narratives while they also "infused this memory with Brethren distinctiveness" (173). He contends that this negotiation can be seen most clearly in the Brethren remembrances of Abraham Lincoln. He shows that the early Brethren responses to the president's death both reflected the "sorrow and anger" of the national discourse and also the church's internal divisions about how to relate to the nation-state: Some Brethren mourned a great leader's tragic death while others argued that "God was no respecter of persons and Abraham Lincoln's death was ultimately no different from that of any other human" (175). The fog of memory, however, transformed Brethren views of the Great Emancipator. At the height of nationwide "Lincoln adulation" in the early twentieth century, Brethren

consistently "depicted Lincoln as showering the peace churches with preferential treatment" and treating the Dunkers as "exemplary Christians" (176). Some Brethren in this period even disseminated an "apocryphal" story of Lincoln receiving a secret Dunker baptism (178). Jerviss uses his study to gesture toward the ways in which the Civil War and its legacies contributed to the transformation of Brethren identity in America.

Another valuable contribution is Nathan Daugherty's study of Grace Brethren white women missionaries in the Central African Republic. He begins by arguing what historians of missions already know: that women were essential to the strength and vitality of the mission program. But in addition, Daugherty shows the ways in which white denominational executives sought to curtail the power these women exercised from overseas and how the women nevertheless pursued important work and even "at times . . . stretched the limits of what was acceptable within the church and mission" (168). Daugherty's study profitably illuminates the dynamic intersections of gender, religion, and power in a transnational context.

As may be surmised from some of my preceding comments, I was surprised by the volume's lack of attention to intersectional issues of race, class, and gender, particularly given its theme of intersections. Daugherty's chapter referenced above is the only contribution that explicitly centers the theme of gender in its analysis. None center race or class, though those themes emerge in certain chapters. At least among the historians and theologians, the default mode of analysis seems to be an older tradition of scholarship that emphasizes theological beliefs in the construction of religious identity, rather than issues of race, class, and gender. Fortunately, this situation means that considerable opportunity exists for future scholars of the Brethren traditions to tackle such matters.

Overall, I found this volume useful. While its main appeal will be to members of the denominations within these Brethren traditions, scholars of Anabaptism broadly conceived may find value in the contributors' varied explorations and the frameworks that they use for their studies, some of which might be profitably employed by scholars who study Mennonites, Amish, Brethren in Christ, and related groups.

Messiah University DEVIN C. MANZULLO-THOMAS

Die Täufer. Von der radikalen Reformation zu den Baptisten. By Thomas Kaufmann. München: C. H. Beck, 2019. €9.95.[5]

This book appears in a series designed for the general public, published in Munich by C. H. Beck, which offers concise, attractively written handbooks on a wide variety of historical, literary, and political themes. Thomas Kaufmann has

5. The English version of this review appears by kind permission of the *Theologische Literaturzeitung*.

been remarkably successful in summarizing a wealth of sound scholarship and new perspectives in this little book. It boasts an extensive bibliography, well-chosen illustrations, and an unusually clear map on the expansion of the Anabaptists into central Europe up to 1550.

The narrative catches rather well the complicated and colorful story of the emergence of the Anabaptist movement—Storch, Müntzer, Karlstadt, and the Swiss. "While Anabaptism certainly has its roots in the generative processes of the early Reforming movement it only crystallized into a sociological phenomenon after the ritual events of 21 January 1525. . . "(31). The reference, of course, is to Grebel's baptism by Blaurock. From the very beginning separatist and revolutionary mentalities are seen as struggling for the upper hand. The complicated relationship of the Peasants' War to the Anabaptists, or Baptists (*Täufer*) as the author prefers to call them, is exemplified in the activities in Waldshut und// Nikolsburg of Hubmaier, "the most outstanding theologian among the early Baptist movement" (36). Yet the clash of biblicist, mystical, and apocalyptical elements helps to account for the "dynamic attractiveness" of the movement. On the one hand, the Schleitheim Confession (1527) sets an insurmountable barrier to contemporary societal norms. On the other hand, we see Hans Hut's creative adaptation of the Müntzer heritage and—after inhuman persecution, especially in the Catholic territories—the tragic experiment of the Anabaptist kingdom in Münster, whose various phases are carefully differentiated. The polygamy in the city should not be misunderstood as a libertine phenomenon (59).

There was considerable demographic variety in the Anabaptist communities, especially in the rural areas. Their central concern—to lead an authentic, Christian life as followers of their Lord—was never recognized by the secular authorities, with the exception of those in Moravia and Holland. Despite this the Anabaptists developed an "experimental space" for participation and equality, thereby "contributing in a major way to the democratizing above all of North American society" (114).

The Austerlitzer in Moravia, the Sabbatarians in Bohemia, the Hutterites in the Tyrol and Moravia, the Swiss Brethren, and the Mennonites in North and Central Europe were all "free communities who had turned their back on violence." Despite the notorious "fissiparity" of the Anabaptists, their main characteristics emerge clearly, and leading figures such as Wilhelm Reublin, Pilgram Marpeck, Jakob Hutter, and Menno Simons are all given their due.

Chapter 5 describes the main features of the Anabaptists as preparedness for suffering and a social ethic of holiness. Attention is paid to their clandestine network of contacts and their special greetings for one another: "lieve bruder Godes frede sei mit iw" (beloved brother in God, peace be with you). Modes of baptism varied as did attitudes to what we would today call the media.

Tolerance gradually increased during the Early Modern era, especially in the Netherlands. The English Civil War saw the emergence of the Baptists, but also of William Fox's Quakers, who did away with sacraments entirely, and who found various ways to integrate with the continental Baptists. For example, the

Mennonites were influenced both by Quaker missionaries and by the German Pietists.

From the seventeenth century on, North America offered safe asylum to the radically separatist Amish, the pacifist Hutterities, and other deviant religious groups, thereby becoming a "unique laboratory" of religion and culture. From its historical origins the Baptist movement has been part of that process of transformation, which was to be further developed in Protestantism. A welcome and rather unusual feature of this book is the lifeline it throws between the sixteenth-century Anabaptists and other religious groupings in today's world.

A key issue for the Anabaptists was always their "discomfort with the powers that be." "They survived despite what was often massive repression and out of their experience as minorities they forged new understandings of tolerance and religious freedom" (113). Their alternative lifestyle and practices in regard to private property, marriage, and congregational polity offered a wide variety of options.

Today, Anabaptists number approximately 2.2 million baptized members; but the Baptists claim 41 million members, constituting one of the largest Protestant denominations.

One might, perhaps, ask whether the often highly conservative political and social views of today's Baptists qualify them to be seen as the heirs of the Radical Reformation. When one thinks, though, of the Mennonites and the Quakers, the picture looks somewhat different.

University of Otago PETER MATHESON

Mennocostals: Pentecostal and Mennonite Stories of Convergence. Edited by Martin William Mittelstadt and Brian K. Pipkin. Pentecostals, Peacemaking and Social Justice Series, no. 12. Eugene, Ore.: Pickwick Publications. 2020. $25.

In systematic theology, the field of pneumatology studies the Holy Spirit and its work. Pneumatology traditionally also includes ecclesiology, the doctrine of the church, as a subset of that doctrine. Put more simply, the Holy Spirit is the breath of the church, which is the body of Christ. This slim volume of historical, biographical, and theological reflection tells intimate stories of the intersection of the Holy Spirit with the historical strands of the Pentecostal and Anabaptist-Mennonite traditions. Through an exploration of the Spirit's movement in healing, in alternative communities, and in the radical testimony of God's alternative way of justice and shalom, these scholars and church leaders from two seemingly different bodies find they share a common breath and a common vision in the Spirit of Christ.

This common breath and vision—or "convergence," as the subtitle puts it—is wrapped neatly in the coinage "Mennocostals" in the book's title. In his

introduction, Martin W. Mittelstadt, a professor of the New Testament at Evangel University in Springfield, Missouri, describes his encounters with Mennonites while growing up as a Pentecostal in southern Manitoba and beginning his academic career. This led Mittelstadt to write his early essay "My Life as a Mennocostal," and to later conceive of this edited volume with Brian Pipkin, an executive assistant at Mennonite Disaster Service and a published Mennonite author. *Mennocostals* is the fruit of their collaboration and research.

The book includes a variety of ecumenical, professional, and ethnic backgrounds, though, to their credit, the editors regretfully note that the diversity of contributors could have been even greater. The most notable exceptions, in terms of diversity, are the contributions of César García, former chair of the Colombian Mennonite Church and current general secretary of the Mennonite World Conference, and Natasha G. Wiebe, an adjunct assistant professor of education at the University of Windsor (a contribution diverse both in gender and professional area of study). Other contributors include sociologists and scholars of nonviolence, professors of Latinx theology, Methodist pastors, Mennonite global workers, and Pentecostal missionaries—and the final contributor, a historical figurehead of the Mennonite church, Menno Simons himself (at least in reprint form).

García's contribution, "Mennocostals in a Contextual Way," situates the overlap between Mennonites and Pentecostals in the Colombian context. García emphasizes the discipleship-centered relationship with Christ that forms in a context of suffering and violence like that experienced in Colombia. He sees similarities in the two streams of Christianity in alternative community-based lifestyles, an emphasis on biblically-informed experience, and the hard challenges undertaken as non-mainstream Christianity faces an established church too often focused on quietism, nationalism, and individualist triumphalism.

Matthew Paugh provides an intriguing and novel theological construction in his essay "Explorations of a Methomennocostal: Wesleyan Theology as Grist for Pentecostal-Anabaptist Conversion." As a Mennonite adjunct instructor of theology who teaches ecclesiology and pneumatology at a Methodist seminary, I personally resonated with Paugh's creative weaving of these traditions. Paugh puts Methodist theologian John Wesley's "heart religion," both personal and social, in conversation with Pentecostalism and his emphasis on intentional community that he associates with Anabaptism. He writes strikingly:

> At heart, all three movements emphasize that salvation implies transformation. God's grace enables believers to live differently. This conviction separates these movements from traditional Reformation perspectives that declare believers simultaneously sinners and saints. . . . Their respective soteriologies underscore that Pentecostalism denotes more than evangelicalism plus tongues, and that Anabaptism entails more than evangelicalism plus peace. (43)

Paugh's ecumenical soteriology provides a lovely theological foundation for further conversation between these three traditions.

Co-editor Pipkin's essay "Mennocostal: Living in the Liminal" is perhaps the most philosophically technical in the volume, but its tone is slightly too defensive

in his feeling of liminality in the communities he has experienced. Pipkin recounts his experience of living on the margins of Pentecostal evangelicalism, introverted academia, and social activism alike. He cautions against equating extroversion with faithfulness, statements on paper with faithful action, and economic commodification with creating Christian disciples. Pipkin provides an especially thoughtful critique of the danger of normative doctrine in a communal setting.

At the beginning of his essay, Pipkin observes, "Personal narratives are messy, complex, and anecdotal" (52). This pertinent observation reflects the diverse character of the rest of the essays in the book. As a theologian rather than a historian, I found it sometime difficult to discern how helpful personal biographies are to future academic contributions. Perhaps the goal for the authors was simply to tell their narratives in an attempt to connect to others from differing backgrounds. However, the biographical sketches that make up seven of the eleven contributions often seem long on personal detail and short on theological payoff. This may have been due to the lack of diversity that the authors originally intended for the volume.

The most unique contribution comes from Wiebe's essay, "Stories We Live By: Convergences in Community Narratives of Mennonites and Pentecostals." Wiebe describes this essay as a "comparative narrative inquiry" (146). She compares her own vignettes of growing up Pentecostal, speaking in tongues, Bible quiz "sword drills," and military parades with Mennonite communal singing and peacemaking, and both groups' self-identification as "God's chosen people." Wiebe's illustrations exemplify how comparative inquiry can provide helpful juxtapositions of biographical narratives that exemplify larger communal and theological trends.

The volume interestingly includes Menno Simons's essay "How the Holy Apostles Practiced Baptism in the Water" in its 1871 English translation. In a short introductory note, the editors state that although many of the contributors may disagree with the typically harsh Reformation sectarian tone of Simons's writing, this particular example was included as an example of countercultural Christian protest movements. However, it is again unclear how this particular essay might contribute to a "Mennocostal" convergence, especially without the inclusion of a parallel Pentecostal example. Readers might ask themselves if the editors included historical texts in contemporary selections either as way to reference history by self-referencing historical texts or as a kind of historical proof-texting.

The uncapitalized use of the adjective "pentecostal" throughout while "Mennonite" retained its capital letter stood out as well. Some explanation of why this choice was made would have been an interesting contribution to the parallels between Pentecostal and Mennonite Christians throughout the essays and stories in this volume. As Ryan R. Gladwin says in his essay "Why I Like the Quiet Peace of Mennonites and Loud Liberation of Pentecostals: The Transformative Possibility of Mennocostal Ethics and Praxis," Mennonites and Pentecostals share a keen desire to return to the radical and counter-Imperial community of the early Christian church. The community portrayed in the New Testament and the documents of the early church exemplified a life woven together by the Holy Spirit, manifested in non-hierarchical leadership, mutual sharing, and a

commitment to justice for the poor and nonviolent witness to the power of Christ. This volume of essays continues a dialogue between siblings that retells the story of that early community in a contemporary world. Although not strictly a theological collection or a text for students, this volume's stories should prove useful to church historians and ecumenical theologians alike.

Iliff School of Theology JEREMY GARBER

Another Way: Thinking Together about the Holy Spirit. By Jeremy Garber. Eugene, Ore.: Pickwick Publications. 2019. $23.

Jeremy Garber presents an interesting thesis on understanding the Holy Spirit in a "Christian minoritarian context" (1). This is the context in which he believes "communal creation and transmission take place" and "we can fruitfully and faithfully understand the Holy Spirit" (1). The concept of a "minoritarian context" is based on the philosophy of Giles Deleuze and Felix Guattari, who suggest that true creative interpretation of pneumatology best takes place in minority settings rather than in majority belief systems. The flexibility of minoritarian concepts allows for "constructive theology" that is specific to a "particular time and place" (2) in contrast to the systematic theology that exists within the majority community. Garber takes this thesis and applies it to the study of the Holy Spirit in various Christian contexts. This includes an engagement with both Old and New Testament Scriptures, historical Anabaptist hermeneutics, and a case study in a twenty-first century interpretive community. He concludes with a summary of how pneumatology might be approached in a minoritarian environment that includes constructive theology based in communal interpretations of the Holy Spirit. This concept of creative thinking, he argues, provides a minoritarian alternative to a "hostile and oppressive majoritarian world" (147)—what Garber calls *Another Way* of understanding the Holy Spirit.

Garber presents a well-researched and in-depth consideration of the philosophical concept of minoritarian community and its importance to creative interpretation and constructive theology. The necessity of contextual theology is an important part of Christian witness in our increasingly global and ever-changing technological society. Garber draws a parallel between the thesis put forward by Deleuze and Guattari—that creativity often takes place "outside of the accepted bounds of academic scientific thought" (4)—and the theology of the Holy Spirit held within the Mennonite faith tradition that moves "through the egalitarian discernment of the gathered body" (4). While he notes the controversies regarding John Howard Yoder's theology—particularly Yoder's history of sexual abuse—Garber nevertheless draws on Yoder's work to explore the connection between the minoritarian philosophy and the place Anabaptism has had in the majoritarian realm of the Christian tradition. He suggests that the concept of the

"Holy Spirit" may be traced through the Hebrew and Christian Scriptures as well as in the "Radical Reformers" of the early Anabaptist movement.

The mid-section of the book examines the Holy Spirit in Scripture and history, exploring the "interpretation that mutually illustrate[s] the pneumatology of minoritarian communal hermeneutics" (27). Garber begins by examining the Scriptures through the lens of 1 Samuel 8 and the prophet Ezekiel for the role of God's spirit within the minoritarian community. His analysis of these two examples demonstrates the important role the Spirit of God played in both of these cases. Likewise, he examines the community of Jesus' Spirit and the prophetic imagination seen in the Gospel narratives. Garber traces the importance of the Spirit through Yoder's work, finding that as the Holy Spirit urges movement out of majoritarianism, "new and creative strategies . . . effect [the] de-sedimentation in the larger society" (65). The work would have been strengthened here through engagement with several Pentecostal scholars who could be considered part of a minoritarian movement within the Protestant evangelical faith tradition. Works such as *The Scripture Principle* (2009) by Clark H. Pinnock and Barry L. Collen, and John Christopher Thomas's *The Spirit of the New Testament* (2005), examine closely the role of the Spirit in Scripture and the majoritarian interpretation that has often not been included in hermeneutical understandings of Scripture.

In his brief summary of the Spirit in history (chap. 3), Garber notes the Anabaptist communal hermeneutic that rejected the majoritarian construct of "the authority of clergy or academics of biblical interpretation" (70). The Radical Reformation of the sixteenth century serves as a model to illustrate "the pneumatology of minoritarian communal hermeneutics" (102). The concept is there; however, a clear focus on the work of the Spirit is a little difficult to discern. Again, some additional engagement with Pentecostal scholars may have strengthened the understanding here. Amos Yong's work, *Spirit-Word-Community: Theological Hermeneutics in Trinitarian Perspective* (2002), for example, would be helpful in understanding the communal work of the Spirit that begins with Scripture in pneumatological narratives that are fleshed out in the communal setting of the church.

The final chapters of the book explore a case study and offer a conclusion for the basis of his thesis. A minoritarian community called Another Way is a ministry started by a Mennonite minister with the intent of engaging people who would not normally identify with an established church. Many of the participants in Another Way identified themselves as "spiritual" but not "religious." While Garber's case study is from a contemporary setting, several things should be noted. The gatherings of artists at Another Way allowed for free expression, often understood as an act of spirituality. What is interesting is that there does not seem to be a connection made here with the Holy Spirit as the indwelling unifier that is the source of creativity. While institutional "religion" was seen as the majoritarian construct, Garber does not explicitly address the unification of the artist and the creator God mediated by the Holy Spirit. This misses the importance of the Holy Spirit. S/he is unique to each person as well as a unifying common bond. Creativity does not necessarily need to be seen as an act that can only take place outside of an orthodox understanding of God. From the beginning of time, creation has

always happened in community with Father, Son, and Spirit (Gen. 1:28; Jn. 1:1-3). Individuality can be found within the community through the indwelling of the Holy Spirit, which is a point that may have been missed by those leading Another Way.

Overall, the book has identified some key elements in understanding the role and work of the Holy Spirit within the framework of Mennonite theology and history. Garber's analysis in the final paragraphs of the book does just that. He suggests a "reorganized picture of the concept of the Holy Spirit" (132) that sees pneumatology as "minoritarian . . . creativity and movement [and] the communal creation of meaning" (132). He also includes "nonhierarchical nonviolence as a particular and unique mode of minoritarian becoming" (132) as part of the restructured pneumatology. For minoritarian communities in our contemporary contexts, Garber argues that it is this pneumatology that will move the church forward in the mission to which she has been called. The elements of this kind of minoritarian community will only be effective through the empowerment and unification of the Holy Spirit. Garber's work opens Mennonite theology to a pneumatological understanding of who they are and where they came from, and opens the way for more research in this area. As noted, continued conversations with Pentecostal/charismatic scholarships will only strengthen this area of study going forward.

Evangelical Seminary JODY FLEMING

Living in the World: How Conservative Mennonites Preserved the Anabaptism of the Sixteenth Century. By Ronald C. Jantz. Eugene, Oregon: Wipf & Stock. 2020. $26.

"Conservative Mennonites" are a subset of plain Anabaptists who have only recently come to the attention of scholars. While sharing characteristics such as plain dress and other markers of nonconformity with their better known Old Order Mennonite and Amish cousins, they drive cars and have few technology restrictions, other than a selective use of media. Most present day "Conservative Mennonites" trace their roots to the Swiss Brethren and the Mennonite migrations to Pennsylvania in the eighteenth century. They are also heirs of the aggressive conservatism of the early twentieth-century Old Mennonite Church, which incorporated an activist program of Sunday schools, revival meetings, and mission work into a traditional church ethos framed by emphases on nonresistance and nonconformity. Distinct from these is another "Conservative Mennonite" group, the Church of God in Christ, Mennonite (Holdeman Mennonites), with its background in the Flemish, Prussian, and Russian Mennonite experience. This is the subject of Jantz's book.

To appreciate Jantz's treatment, the reader must accept it for what it is, and what it is not. Jantz, a retired librarian from Rutgers University, is the son of parents who had briefly been members of the Holdeman Mennonite Church. Having grown up in rural Kansas with numerous extended family members who

are still Holdeman, he writes as an outsider with insider connections, seeking to understand the religious community that helped form his familial world. He acknowledges that his book is "in many ways returning to a landscape that has great meaning for me." Yet, he also has a larger purpose in mind. He believes that the Holdeman Mennonite Church's "culture, practices, and ethics hold a message for a modern society enmeshed in political chaos and one that is being transformed by technology and social media." So as both an exercise in self-understanding and a challenge to modernity, *Living in the World* is not a scholarly study that updates or revises Clarence Hiebert's *The Holdeman People* (1973), the only full-fledged study of the group to date.

Jantz divides his book into two parts. "Part One – The European Experience" sketches out the beginnings of Anabaptism, the importance of Menno Simons, and the world of the Dutch Mennonites. The footnotes indicate that Jantz has depended on the standard secondary works on Anabaptism for this part of his narrative. He then focuses on one group of Dutch Mennonites, the Groningen Old Flemish Society. He traces this group's migrations from the Netherlands to Przechowka in Prussia, and to Ostrog in Volhynia—the part of Poland ceded to the Russian Empire in the eighteenth century. He describes this group as more culturally resistant to assimilation than some other Mennonites who followed a similar path of migration and settlement. A later generation of "Ostrogers," faced with the Russian government's threat of removing the military service exemption, immigrated to the Unites States, where they settled in Lone Tree Township near Canton, Kansas, in the 1870s.

John Holdeman visited the Lone Tree settlement in 1878, and persuaded the Ostrogers to join his new church. Originally from Old Mennonite background in Ohio, Holdeman broke with the old church over what he had perceived as spiritual lukewarmness. While Holdeman's theology was shaped by the Swiss Brethren concept of the two kingdoms, he was also influenced by reading Menno Simons, particularly in adopting social avoidance when applying the ban. Following the *Martyrs Mirror,* Holdeman also developed a theology of the succession of the true visible church from the time of Christ to the seventeenth century. Holdeman saw the Old Mennonite Church as the heir of the church described in the *Martyrs Mirror*. However, when the Old Mennonites rejected his leadership in the 1850s, Holdeman argued that its candlestick had passed to his church. Until his visit to the Lone Tree settlement, his ideas had gained very little traction. However, the Ostrogers' acceptance of his leadership and the incorporation of a group of Kleine Gemeinde Mennonites in Manitoba gave Holdeman's church the critical mass it needed to survive and flourish. Since the Ostrogers and Kleine Gemeinde did not fit into his lineage, Holdeman had to rebaptized them into his church. Nevertheless, the preponderance of members from a Russian Mennonite background meant that their cultural practices of the new group would shape the future identity of the Holdeman Mennonites.

"Part Two–Nonresistance and a People Apart" argues that the Church of Christ, Mennonite through its retention of two important distinctives is the true heir of sixteenth-century Anabaptism. Since Holdeman did not include the Ostrogers in his lineage, Jantz's treatment is not exactly parallel, but it is still

reminiscent of Holdeman's scheme. To flesh out his argument, Jantz uses the Schleitheim Articles as his reference point for early Anabaptism, and then compares them to contemporary Holdeman Mennonite thinking by quoting from various articles in the *Messenger of Truth,* the Holdeman Mennonite periodical. He sees striking similarities. Defenselessness is solidly entrenched. When it comes to nonconformity, he observes that the Holdeman Mennonites are facing challenges, as the forces of the larger society bear down on their communities and as evangelistic efforts thins out the ethnic cast of their church. Yet, he is optimistic that they can retain their nonconformist stance. For Jantz, the Holdeman Mennonites embody "Peaceful living, humility, honesty, the refusal to take up arms, and living within moderate means." All these traits, he believes "could benefit the world by finding more prominence in a violent and war-torn society."

Jantz achieved his objectives in writing *Living in the World,* but one could wish that he had done more. I would have liked some quantitative analysis as to how frequently articles about peace and nonconformity appear in the *Messenger of Truth.* Are there other theological and ethical themes that come to the fore that do not fit a strictly Schleitheim paradigm? Nineteenth-century American Evangelical Protestant innovations like Sunday schools, revival meetings, mission organizations, and a predilection for gospel songs clearly made their way into the Holdeman church. Also, Holdeman Mennonites borrowed from Evangelical Protestantism a revival-based crisis new birth experience as a normative for conversion. Schleitheim does not account for these innovations. This suggests that Holdeman Mennonites are more than strictly heirs of Menno Simons. In contrast to Old Order and other Conservative Anabaptist groups, Holdeman Mennonites downplay the importance of rules, in favor of emphasizing the direction of the Holy Spirit. Yet they have very definite expectations for their members. How do they manage to insist on those expectations, while rhetorically dismissing the need for rules? These are questions I wish Jantz would have explored. Finally, to use the term "conservative Anabaptist" as synonymous with the Church of God in Christ, Mennonite, ignores the other more numerous "conservative Anabaptists" of Old Mennonite, Amish, and Brethren origins.

Young Center for Anabaptist and Pietist Studies, EDSEL BURDGE JR.
Elizabethtown College

American Harvest: God, Country, and Farming in the Heartland. By Marie Mutsuki Mockett. Minneapolis: Graywolf Press. 2020. $ 28.

For decades the lure of following the harvest with large machines traversing thousands of acres of cropland has captured the imagination of many agrarian-minded youth. Being on this journey through the heartland is seen by some as a type of initiation rite toward adulthood. Embracing hard work, seeing new landscapes, and encountering new people and cultures become the context for exploring the inner self.

Marie Mutsuki Mockett is motivated to follow the harvest for similar reasons, but with the locus emerging from her family's land in western Nebraska. She recalls many childhood trips from California to Nebraska to visit her father's family and their land during harvest time. While her pilgrimages back to Nebraska were less frequent as a young adult she maintained a connection to this place that has a 100-year history in her father's family. She inherited a portion of the land when her father died, which meant she developed a new kind of relationship with the land and the crew of harvesters who came annually to her land as part of their trek from Texas to Idaho.

Mutsuki Mockett's father had a deep respect for Eric Wolgemuth, a custom harvester, and the quality of work he did in the family's wheat fields. For thirty years, Wolgemuth followed the wheat harvest, first as a crew member and then as the owner of a team. Wolgemuth annually leaves his home and farm in Lancaster, Pennsylvania, to cut grain from May until the end of the summer. He is a devout Christian with a Mennonite heritage. Most of his crew members come from Mennonite families in Pennsylvania. Through the years Mutsuki Mockett developed a close friendship with Wolgemuth and his family. Together they had many conversations about approaches to farming, as he patiently responded to her questions. One winter Eric Wolgemuth and his wife, Emily, visited Mutsuki Mockett in New York City to better understand her city perspectives. During that visit, he encouraged Mutsuki Mockett to spend a summer traveling with his crew as a way to understand the divide between city and rural viewpoints.

Mutsuki Mockett, an accomplished writer, accepted the invitation to travel with his team in the summer of 2017. *American Harvest* is an account of her personal experiences and observations of life and farming in the American heartland. She records her thoughts, questions, emotions, and learnings with openness and integrity.

The multifaceted ways that people are intertwined with land and its deeper meaning drives the narrative of this book. The storyline of *American Harvest* is from the perspective of an itinerate person rather than from someone established in a single community. Mutsuki Mockett shows a personal transparency about the challenges of encountering new concepts and viewpoints within the harvest crew, the rural communities, and the agricultural system. She is deliberative in her reflections as demonstrated by her frequent references to other thinkers and writers throughout the book, as well as in her extensive bibliography.

One of the values of this book is the way Mutsuki Mockett responds to new concepts along the way. She carefully unpacks questions that arise and models curiosity as a beginner or a novice. For example, throughout the harvest journey Mutsuki Mockett wrestles with personal identity questions. Her reflections indicate that she is familiar with finding her place in different cultures. She was born to a Japanese mother and a white father from Nebraska. The majority of her childhood was spent in California, with visits to both Japan and Nebraska. Her identity quest as an adult continued mainly through life experiences in urban settings on both the East and West coasts of the United States. The heartland encounters in the summer of 2017 raised new identity queries. She was frequently cognizant that she was a person of color in a white, rural America. She also

encountered perspectives regarding masculinity and femininity that were very different from her views. Crew members made clear that they believed she lacked the skills for cooking or driving a tractor, which fostered feelings of inadequacy on her part. She was told that her understanding of farming was at the level of an 8-year old. In spite of these challenges, she continued in her commitment to learn and become more self-knowing.

Thoughtful endeavors to find meaning in Christianity are woven throughout the book. Mutsuki Mockett has limited knowledge about Mennonites, which leads to many questions for members of the crew, who all have Anabaptist roots. Yet the team members are not unified in their viewpoints on Christianity. In fact, the crew divides into two factions during the summer with one group, who have attended college, being more liberal. The other group is more conservative and unwilling to explore harder questions about faith. Mutsuki Mockett is able to connect more closely with the first group and benefits from the wise and mediating approach that Eric Wolgemuth contributes. The crew goes to church every Sunday in towns close to where they are harvesting. This exposes her to a wide array of congregational styles and theologies, which often leaves her with tearful questions. After attending multiple churches, she observes that the sermons primarily focused on knowing God and the Bible, but did not emphasize loving others.

Mutsuki Mockett explores many facets of Christianity as evidenced by her bibliography. Some of the authors are recommended by the more liberal crew members. She buys her first Bible early in the summer and reads to see how it relates to the Christian viewpoints she is encountering. While the bibliography is rather extensive for the genre of the book, it is ironic that she doesn't list any books about or by Anabaptist writers. Mutsuki Mockett also has interactions with Indigenous people and Mormons during the summer. The variety of contacts that she has portrays the heartland's reality, even as she struggles with making sense of the complexities and incongruencies.

The rural and urban divide, a major motivation for the summer journey, is a constant element in the narrative, frequently represented in the questions Mutsuki Mockett asks of the crew members, as well as in the questions they ask of her. In addition to the many conversations about Christianity, there are contrasting viewpoints on science, climate change, sexuality, economics, the decline of small towns, and societal injustices. A key conversational thread twines around agriculture and food systems. Some of the tensions apparent in her conversations with the team arise from differing perceptions, urban and rural, about food and agricultural systems.

Mutsuki Mockett articulates the complexity of her experiences: "I feel myself to be all ages at once. I'm eight on the farm, I'm forty-six in the city, and I'm maybe twenty here talking about God and the structure of the modern evangelical church" (327). She shares her summer's quest with transparency and integrity. She demonstrates a learner's approach to grappling with hard and often divisive issues. *American Harvest* opens a window to understanding the tensions in the United States and offers the reader a model for finding spaces of common ground.

Goshen College LUKE GASCHO